

Cypriot Journal of Education Sciences

Volume 17, Issue 5, (2022) 1508-1516

Cypitol Journal of Educational Sciences

www.cjes.eu

Western influence in the creation of sculpture education and monuments

Sezer Cihaner Keser*, Van Yuzuncu Yil University, Fine Arts Faculty, Department of Sculpture, 65080, Van, Turkey, https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5954-1301

Hanife Neris Yuksel, Akdeniz University, Fine Arts Faculty, Department of Sculpture, 07058, Antalya, Turkey, https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0381-3950

Suggested Citation:

Keser, S. C. & Yuksel, H. N. (2022). Western influence in the creation of sculpture education and monuments. *Cypriot Journal of Educational Science*. *17*(5), 1508-1516 https://doi.org/10.18844/cjes.v17i5.7255

Received from January 16, 2022; revised from April 22, 2022; accepted from May 22, 2022. ©2022 Birlesik Dunya Yenilik Arastirma ve Yayincilik Merkezi. All rights reserved.

Abstract

Many powers use art as a mean to transform social and political culture. The aim of this study is to examine approach and relationship between the ideological and social conditions of arts, culture and education policy with regard the power in the example of Sculpture Art Education in a eurasia state. This research has been done in accordance with document analysis, which is one of the qualitative research methods. In this direction, the document analysis covers the years 1923-1956. In the study, art education policies were set out based on the political and cultural influences of the period. In addition, the spread of revolution was examined from the point of how the art of sculpture come true and its interaction with western. The relationship between sculpture education and applied sculptures has been handled with the defined ideological dynamics.

Key Words: Art; Education; Ideology, Sculpture Education; Westernization,

Email address: sezercihaner@gmail.com / Tel +904322251701-05

^{*} ADDRESS OF CORRESPONDENCE: Sezer Cihaner Keser, Van Yuzuncu Yil University, Fine Arts Faculty, Department of Sculpture 65080, Van, Turkey

1. Introduction

It is known that most of the statue which has been made for specific aims, in the Anatolian geography which has hosted many civilizations. It is not possible to mention about history of Turkish sculpture after the human and animal figures found from Seljuks art of sculpture. Although Anatolia has such a rich cultural geography, there has been intergenerational transmission of information via the western tradition of art (Taş, 2011). We can say that the major reason of the brake in Anatolian art of sculpture that Turkish society remains customs belongs to nomadic way of life and the ban depiction comes with the convert to islam. In 1882 industry academy of fine established but until sculpture department opened no sculptors grew in this geography.

Therefore, the art of sculpture is not exceeded the size of architectural sculpture and is limited only to certain surface patterns. The cultural aspect of Turkish society to adopt age acuminated up to that day for the financial and emotional product did neither demonstrate competence nor benefitted from the west to western culture's healing period has begun in western countries by taking advantage of the educational institutions are experienced a cultural capital in western society in the arts and artists in the field of education (Gutek, 1988), although many of them experienced applied training in painting and sculpture could start towards the end of the 19th century miniature has become dominant art form in ottoman arts. Just as guild system, the art, master and apprentice relationship in western conception of the artist was raised in the 19th century (Keser, 2006). The aim of these artists is to grow. Because, there is no educational institution which trains artists yet.

All societies may be effected by art. Many power use art as a mean to transform social and political culture. The aim of this study is to examine approach and relatinship between the ideological and social conditions of arts, culture, education policy with regard the power in the case of Turkey. The dynamics which revealed the statue of truth in Turkey stand out with "memorial/monumental statue" practices between the years 1923-1956. This monumental statue of applications intended to build a modern nation of Turkey in the modernization of the futures that have been hosted. Turkish Republic's process of being nation-state. Is thought to be jakoben to find field to practise western sculpture in itself. In the study the spread of revolution, how the art of sculpture come true and it's interection with western. In the first period of republic will be established with a sociologic and historical view.

1.1. Theoretical framework

Art has transformative power. Art creates a roadmap about literature investigating the positive effect of education on social structures, the necessity of art education, education through art in the research shaped on sculpture education. Many powers have seen art as a tool because of the implementation of the cultural policies they have created to ensure social and political transformations. According to that the art education in education policies has also been shaped in this direction. The use of art with this function has caused two important problems. The first of these is the change in the specific conditions of certain branches of art and the function of the artist, which can affect social change and transformation. The second one is the change of the formation and analysis of art in society.

It was Antonio Gramsci who examined in detail the relations between the state and education. In his article titled State and Civil Society, Gramsci states, "The unity of the state is in a sense a combination of different forces." Every state embodies its ethical characteristics, because one of its important functions is to develop a special cultural and moral level in the broad masses. "Educational institutions carry positive functions in this regard." says (Gramsci, 1971). According to Gramsci, one of the most important tasks of the state is education and putting individuals into a form. The aim is often to create a high level of civilization and instil into civilization and moral sentiments to the broad masses. It is necessary to ensure the continuity of the economic production devices and thus to create a new type of human being (Gramsci, 1971). Because education is a part of ideology and society on the one hand, and an integral part of ideology on the other (Kongar, 1985).

Art education is one of the most effective ways for the individual to develop in a balanced and healthy manner, to reach a free and scientific mindset, to have a broad worldview, and to reach a creative personality. According to, the aim of art education should be to develop individuals' ability to design, to raise creative, self-confident young people with artistic literacy and high aesthetic appreciation. When this goal is achieved, a civilized society with the same qualifications will be created.

1.2. Aim of the Study

The aim of this study is to examine approach and relationship between the ideological and social conditions of arts, culture, and education policy with regard the power in the case of Turkey. In the study, it is aimed to reveal the historical background of Turkish Sculpture education, workshop practices and sculptors, who were educated in the first Art institution of the Republic of Turkey. An analysis of sculpture education has been made through the educational policies of the single-party government and the ideological discourses of public space sculptures and examples made in the period. It is thought that art education, which is focused on the development of Turkish Sculpture Art and modelled on the West, will contribute to the improvement of the quality of the practices by improving the skills of the sculptors in their fields, and the art education that has been developed over time will also lead to this situation. The study has an importance in aiming to provide a support for the development and improvement of the quality of sculpture education created with western influence.

2. Method

This part of the study covers evaluation methods and data collection methods. This research was conducted in accordance with document analysis, which is one of the qualitative research methods. In this direction, document analysis; means that the documents related to the researched subject are detailed in accordance with scientific principles (Kıral, 2020).

Document analysis is a method in which historians and archaeologists use features related to the past of a culture or civilization. Therefore, written materials containing information about the facts and facts that are aimed to be researched are sources that present us the unknown about pictures and the past (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2011). Throughout the research, the beginning and development stage of sculpture education in Turkey and the documents about sculpture applications between 1923 and 1946 were examined, art education programs were taken as reference, and literary and visual archives were used.

The Turkish Sculpture Education, which was started in the 20th century, and the monumental applications that were observed to be demanded by the one-party government of the newly established state and located in public space centres constitute full extent of the study. Its sample consists of Sanayii Nefise School, which was the only art education institution of that period, and sculpture education is covered the years 1923-1956. In the research, the data were obtained from the existing literature, archives and digital databases. The information and documents obtained from the relevant literature and archive records were evaluated in terms of the educational policies and ideological characteristics of the newly established republic by determining the current situation.

Political and cultural influences were used in the analysis of monuments, which have a wide variety of facts depending on the period they were built and the place they were applied. The relationship between defined ideological dynamics and sculpture education and applied sculptures has been discussed. The data obtained as a result of the research were interpreted descriptively.

3. Results and Discussion

The field of study of this research is sculpture education and sculpture practices in Turkish art, which corresponds to the twentieth century and later period. The educational policies of the single-party government and the ideological discourses of public space sculptures were analysed through examples. The data collected in the research, which the art education of the mentioned period was examined by considering the chronological order of the sculptures, was collected and presented under two themes. According to that, the development process of western art and effective sculpture

education, which marks the period considered as the first theme, has been described descriptively. In the second theme, the new perception method, which was tried to be created with the large-scale public space sculpture samples applied at that time, was included. In the study, the political-cultural and spatial analyses of ideological expressions at the conceptual and methodological levels were examined while examining the art and education of sculpture.

3.1. Western Influence in the Creation of the Turkish Sculpture Art Education

In Turkish society supporting painting and sculpture and evolving to western form are bounded to one another and aspects of this process in a way that is parallel to the ideological changes. Changing the format of painting which has started during the official of Fatih Sultan Mehmet is a part of ideology of westernization. Western artists entered the country with the power demand and therefore power's role in evolving art of painting into a western format, power's role has become determining.

20th Century closer to the growing developments in the field of art was the result of an ideological stance, painting study in engineering and military schools and establishments of Industry-Academy of Fine should be thought as a result of ideological necessity not the result of artistic concerns. Up to 20th century a limited interest towards art consists of hanedean members of the imperial's capital in Istanbul, soldiers and political intellectuals often depends on personal preferences of the rulers. In the republican period, supporting art was carried out a protection method which based on projects, competitive exhibits, orders, applications and the monumental artists to be employed in state institutions. State, in line with the ideology of modernization, has attempted to guide the art. In the cultural policy of the new-established state to have a national identity and to function art as a facility has an important place.

On January 1, 1882 Industry-Academy of Fine (fine arts school) was established. Osman Hamdi was assigned to the school director and then on March 3,1883 in the building, which Valluri made in the garden of the museum, sculpture, painting and architecture departments began teaching. Industry-Academy of Fine's education system created by inspiring by Paris Ecole Natinole Superieure Des Beaux-Arts'painting and sculpture departments. Each year could only be a student to graduate and these students were sent to Paris and Munich with government scholarships (Gezer, 1984).

However, Turkishness ideology was seem effective among three dominant ideologies of the constitutional period, this school was considered as the facilities of westernization ideology. In the first years of teaching has been fully benefited from international artists. In the process of creating a culture in history to take advantage of foreigners are frequent examples. Rome is one of the most typical examples of this. Romans brought cultivated Greeks to Rome and used them as trainers. All well-educated Romans have been trained by Greeks. In the Hellenistic periods, collection of Works of art tradition which exists among aristocratic Greeks, transported to Roman society (Efland, 1990). Moreover, Ottoman Empire's practice until the day was in this way. Looking at the industry-Academy of Fine extremely.

Nationalistic, although staff's assertion was established composed of foreigners and minorities were found. Yervant Osgan was the teacher of, sculpture classes, Salvator Valery, oil painting classes, Warnia and Zarzecki design classes, Valluri and the assistant P. Bello architectural classes, and Napier engraving classes. Thus, began the period of utilizing from the western to westernization in arts. Industry-Academy of Fine takes advantage of foreigner and minorities has been based on any grounds? In a western sense of artist does not neglect the human figure and an expert in this field was needed, because western artists have reached competence about the descriptive arts and they entered into new guest. Among Turkish artists there was no one who was specialized in the field of human figure except from Osman Hamdi. all of the existing artists specialized in the field of landscape and still life. Whereas the primacy goal of the industry-Academy of Fine is to make society closer to the official figures in western style and to show that Turks also have the ability to do western style art.

Similarly, many of the students seem to be Armenians and Greeks. Arseven told that during his period about 1890 just three Turkish students in painting class Celal Esad Arseven, İsmail Hakkı

Altinbezen, Galip Bey just one Turkish student in sculpture class İlhan Özsoy was educated (Arseven, 1990). The majority of Greek and Armenian students can be seen as a clear indication that Turks still could not put art in their life, did not consider art as an important area of expertise training necessary to be taken and was not able to escape from religious prohibitions. Another reason described by Arseven Celal Esad as fallows by. Drop in the country with the aim of train artists of this school had very few students at that time, most of them were Greek and Armenians who did not expect a future in state civil service and Turkish youth who wants to have free art represents industry-Academy of Fine is considered as crucial step for Turkish Art (Erol, 1980).

According to Nurullah Berk official establishment of Industry Academy of fine took a swing at the belief that sculpture was a worship subject. Thus, it created a renaissance in Turkish sculpture art. However despite the efforts of the Industry-Academy of fine art in sculpture did not show improvement, so in the early years of republic about forty years after the break, There was not competent sculptor in the country, so the monumental sculptures built by international artist Krinnel, Canonica, Hanak, and Thorak Among the general features of these monumental sculptures the major one is that Atatürk is described as face character of the westernization, enlightened refection of the ideology (Demirci, 2011). Of course, it does not mean that industry academy of fine does not grow any sculpture. Turkish painting art evaluated in itself, despite experience a rapid brake through and trained numerous artist it has not been possible to train sculpture artist at the same rate. Until the industrial academy of fine was established in 1883, it is known that there was no other sculptor who is member of ottoman empire except from Yervant Oskan who trained in Rome. But in a yervant oskan trained ilhan özsoy behzat mahir tomruk and nijat sireli in industry academy of fine (Berk,1937). Until 1923, industry academy of fine forty years in the educational process could grow these for sculptors. E renaissance cannot be set to come true with these four sculptors.

After the that of Namık İsmail academy director in 1935, burhan toprak who became academy director in 1936 went the way of restructuring academy. In this period, leopold levy was brought into head of painting department, rudolf belling was brought to head of the sculpture workshop. Although the artists who witnessed of that period did not consider levy's being had as a reform, they were satisfied from belling. The development of sculpture in Turkey got an importance when Kenan Yontuç brought Fidzek Karoly from Hungary. Master Fidzeg, for many years, carried out casting job as the unique name in Beyoglu Narmanlı han workshop (Gezgin, 2003). Fidzeg's name is almost a character in Works of this period as we encountered.

1933 came in to prominence with the 10th anniversary of Republic. During this period memorials and busts of Ataturk were emphasised. Often, revolutionary ideology dominated art, and those who did applicants were not even questioned whether were they artist or not. Amateur sculptors were encouraged through newspaper and magazines. Memorial practices were of their peak between the years 1926-1940. Foreign sculptors made sculptures in many parts of the country and this situation began to be increasingly resented foreign sculptor were Memorial practises which are parallel to republic ideology made by Krippel, canonica, Hanak and thorak and this was criticized by Turkish Sculptors memorial activities in turkey. Sabiha Ziya bengutas, who had worked as an assistant of Canonica, wrote articles for newspaper magazines stating that memorial activities should be made by Turkish sculptors. Nationalism is dominant in this period, Ahmet Hasim revealed his reaction, that "Let's put a large mass of marble or bronze impost to the place of a great monuments and note that "Turkish artist grow until" (Gezer, 1984). These discussions continued for a long time.

Belling is an artist who came from Turkey escaped from Nazi power and Belling Adolf Von trebenenburg came to Academy but remained just two years. Belling came in the Period, in September of 1937, which have great importance for the Turkish plastic Istanbul Arts Painting and Sculpture Museum was opened. Until the 1960s, the museum and the academy served as the institution who fed the art. In the workshop under the management of Belling nature and plastic version were dominant. Belling, who is one of the important figures in Western art in 20th century created an aesthetic of geometric forms of large scale. Although he practiced the late Cubism form of language in

the statue, he did not allow his students to enter modern movements without completed their formation (Cezar, 1973). His students; Hüseyin Anka Ozkan, Hakkı Atamulu, Yavuz Görey, Ismail Gokce, Rahmi Artemiz, MariGerekmezyan, Sadi Calık, Huseyin Gezer, Ilhan Koman, Zerrin Bolukbası, Turgut Pura after Belling discipline, developed their own understanding of form and some of them tended to abstract concept which gained weight after 1950.

Towards 1950s Turkish art of sculpture had part of its development and the artists recognized that they need to catch their age. Even if the sculpture has the secondary importance when compared to art of painting, art of sculpture with the process of seventy years-experience goes to the modernization. "High Sculptors Association" founded in 1948, the organizes exhibitions every year and accelerates the development of this art and its artist. After the 2nd World War non. Figurative art reenters the application in Europe and technical development help its dissemination. A defensive stance came true towards Belling who enunciated that it's theory; for Turkish student. Towards 1950s when Hadi Bara and Zühtü Muridoglu went to Paris and adopts non-figurative point of view. When they came back to Turkey, academic tradition was destroyed, and a division in sculpture workshop is experienced. While Belling workshop goes on his classical education, other workshop under the management of Hadi Bora and Zuhtu Muridoglu geometrical abstractions are experimental; and made experiments by using materials such as wood iron rods, copper plates, ceramics, glass, terracotta. Hadi Bora and Zuhtu Muridoglu's students Kurgun Acar, Ali Teoman Germaner, Gurdal Duyar, Semahat Acuner, Tamer Basoglu provide contemporary Turkish sculpture to live. If it's Belling had been continued his education in his workshop until 1954. Belling, who left the Academy in 1954, gave modelling lessons at ITU Faculty of Architecture between 1954-66 (Gezgin, 2003). With Belling's go through to ITU Faculty of Architecture, another term in the academy has come to an end.

3.2. Sculpture Practices as a Means of Public Education

"The works of art have served for a lot of purposes such as making the propaganda of the administration for the ideological purpose beyond the aesthetic pleasure, from the past to the present. Undoubtedly, the propaganda of the dominant ideology is one of the widely accepted functions of art. Art, especially art of sculpture has been supported by political powers in many periods in order to reinforce their power. It represented the areas where the judge powers were most housed and protected. In almost all periods of history, monumental practices have been used as a splendid method during of spreading the belief or ideological thought by existing powers. Monumental sculptures loaded with messages has been practiced in the various regions and cultures of the world, depending to the changing socio-economic patterns and ideologies and expanding usage areas, increasing number of target groups" (Keser & Telli, 2017).

Looking at Turkey sculpture art history, it can be observed that this history is somehow an artistic patronage history. The historical development of Turkish art has developed widely depending on patronage provided from limited resources. Turkish sculptors, differently than the patronage in the West, could proceed their artistic productions by support and assignment of palace, military and political party respectively. Looking at the Turkish sculpture art history from the patronage point of view, patron completely appears as political ruling party. Similar to USSR, China, Romania and USA examples, ruling party in Turkey considered supporting art as a necessity to make the propaganda of its ideology while some artists concentrated on fulfilling the demands of the ruling party so as to maintain continuity of artistic patronage of ruling party and in order to be incorporated to their projects. Accordingly, the sculptures produced in the states ruled by single party in the first half of 20th century such as USSR, China, Italy and Germany demonstrated similarities. The reason is that education function was assigned to sculpture and was considered as a public education tool and messages were loaded to sculptures.

In reality, Turkish sculpture art started with monumental sculpture projects in 1925. Basic subject of the sculptures was Atatürk. Gezer (1984) stated that the information of community about sculpture was identified with Ataturk and that main purpose of monumental sculptures was

considered as establishment of national consciousness, reinforcement of unity and infusing the newly established order to community. However German sculptors were used instead of Turkish sculptures for presenting monumental sculptures, primary aim of which is keeping the existing ideology alive, to the community. Gezer (1984) states the reason of this fact that there was an impression that Turkish sculptors could not reach to sufficient maturity. The most significant features of painters and sculptors in turkey was that they were always under Western effect and could only survive by the support of the government.

Each ideology appeared as a product of the communal structure and became a fact which took place sometimes within national borders and sometimes in universal dimensions. Therefore, it should not be wrong to evaluate ideology as a social fact. Ideological structuring was active in all ages and it took this strength mostly from the passions of individuals, governments and leaders. This structuring took place mostly in artistic activities. A painting could cause a leader to become eternal unequivocally. It may best represent a government and its activities when necessary. Especially sculpture has been the area which is most leaned on. However, at the same time it was deprived of its self-existence and aesthetic values. It has represented the areas under which dominant forces mostly took shelter for protection. Although dominant ideologies took advantage of painting art, they took more advantage of monuments. Because monuments are not placed in close areas, walls or lounges. Sculptures became a category which can be placed in most crowded avenues, parks, building fronts and public areas of cities. Due to this property of addressing to larger masses, sculptures have been an indispensable option, a propaganda tool and a capital.

It is obvious that the message which is aimed to be given to community in Republic of Turkey since its establishment was loaded to monuments so as to embalm, immortalize and honour the leader. The statement that monuments were placed in central areas and ideological meanings were loaded to them will not be a wrong evaluation. As it can be understood from the examples given in the study, the message that is aimed to be given to community is clearly presented by Ataturk sculptures. This message is embalming the leader, acceptance of his honorary structure and to preserve his political power.

Result

In general, concept of westernization pointed out the modernization and becoming contemporary, used in the sense of adaption of the life style and institution of western society. Westernization, means that efforts of non-western to enter this culture. Westernization is a Catch-all of-culture, beliefs, knowledge, law, ethics, traditions, arts and habits. Thus, westernization culture, covers western knowledge, technology, law, and also western art.

As shown, in 19th century and first half of 20th century in Istanbul, significant improvements in the art have experienced. But all these developments did not come true with the demand of public and did not become public property. These developments were able to perform to the ottoman society who was living in the feudal values system and had lack of social structure by the demand of the family throne or the intellectual trained in western way. After the establishment of republic, they were remained the same way with the attempts of present a new method. Undoubtedly, the education of artists got developed with the aim of improving aesthetics in social life. But, such an absolutely effort developed in a relation with the ideology of that period. Turkish Republic's process of being nation-state. Is thought to be Jakoben to find field to practise western sculpture in itself.

Art of painting and art of sculpture's westernization seriously benefited, during the process of establishing new state and adaptation of its ideology. "Art, has a transformative power in all societies. Many power to ensure social and political transformations that culture policies of implementation that they have created, has seen the art as a means because of this feature. It can be said that using this function of art caused to the formation of two major problems. The first one, which may affect social change and transformation of certain branches of art free conditions and the artist's function to undergo change. Secondly, the formation of the arts and analysis of arts to undergo change in society.

In this study, by taking the relationship between the ideological and social conditions of art and arts, culture, education policy and the approach of the power to this subject is examined in the case of Turkey" (Keser, 2015). As said before, state, in line with the ideology of modernization, has attempted to guide the art. In the cultural policy of the new-established state to have a national identity and to function art as a facility has an important place. It's thought that art of sculpture in westernization process can benefit to base of a mental to create a western society. This situation causes all forms of art to be considered the most important facility to reach western degree the development, expansion, and cost to society and make a state policy.

References

- Arseven, C.E. (1993). Sanat ve siyaset hatıraları, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları,
- Berk, N. (1937). Türk heykeltıraşları, İstanbul: Güzel Sanatlar Akademisi Neşriyatı,
- Cezar, M. (1973). Devlet güzel sanatlar akademisi, İstanbul: Renkler Matbaası,
- Demirci, M. H. (2011). *Türkiye'de heykel sanatının ideolojik bir araç olarak kullanımı* (Tez No. 294752) [Yüksek lisans tezi, Mustafa Kemal Üniversitesi]. Yükseköğretim Kurulu Ulusal Tez Merkezi.
- Efland, A.D. (1990). A history of art education. New York: Teachers College.
- Erol, T. (1980). Başlangıcından bugüne çağdaş türk resmi. İstanbul: Tiglat Basımevi.
- Gezer, H. (1984). Cumhuriyet dönemi türk heykeli. Ankara: İş Bankası Yayınları.
- Gezgin, A. (2003). Akademi'ye tanıklık i: güzel sanatlar akademisine bakışlar resim ve heykel. Bağlam Yayıncılık, İstanbul,
- Gramsci, A. (1971). *Selections from prison notebooks.* (Ed. Quinten Hoare, Geoffrey Smitth), New York, international Publishers.
- Gutek, G. (1988). Ideolgial and philosaphical perspectives on education. London Allyn and Bacon.
- Keser, N. (2006). Tek *parti döneminde türk resim sanatının ideolojik üretimi*. Yayımlanmamış Doktora Tezi, Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü,
- Keser, S. (2015). The relation between art education and ideology in the case of Turkey, *Global Journal on Humanites & Social Sciences*, 1(1), 233-238.http://www.world-education-center.org/index.php/pntsbs/article/view/3579/3211
- Keser, S. & Telli, H. (2017). Eskiçağda dinsel ve ideolojik söylemlerin anıtsal kaya yontularında görselleşmesi / vısualızatıon of religious and ideological discourses in monumental rock sculptures in antiquity", *Turkish Studies -International Periodical for the Languages, Literature and History of Turkish*,12(3),607-630. https://doi.org/10.7827/TurkishStudies.11442
- Kıral, B. (2020). Nitel Bir Veri Analizi Yöntemi Olarak Veri Analizi. Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi, 8 (15), 170-189).
- Kongar, E. (1985). Toplumsal değişme kuramları ve türkiye gerçeği, İstanbul. Remzi Kitabevi.
- Taş, G. (2011). Tarihsel gelişim sürecinde çevrenin heykelle, heykelin de çevreyle ilişkilendirilmesi (Tez No. 304189) [Yüksek lisans tezi, Atatürk Üniversitesi]. Yükseköğretim Kurulu Ulusal Tez Merkezi.

Yıldırım, A. & Şimşek, H. (2011). Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri (8. Baskı). Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık.